

2010-2013 LDSA PROGRAM

LOCAL DESIGN CONSULTANT SELECTION PROCEDURE

A Request For Qualifications (RFQ) pursuant to the ad in the New York State Contract Reporter was made available to any engineering design firm by request at www.countyhwys.org or by mail by contacting the New York State County Highway Superintendents' Association, 119 Washington Ave. Suite 300, Albany, NY 12210 at 518-465-1694. Engineering consultants responded by sending an Expression of Interest (EOI) in accordance with the terms of the RFQ. What follows is the procedure each region shall use to establish the list of qualified firms.

A. REGIONAL CONSULTANT LIST

A.1 Selection of the Regional Consultant List

The LDSA regional coordinator should invite all the Counties and any municipalities with multiple projects on the Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) within each region to participate in the selection committee. Each participant in the selection will receive a copy of the EOI. Only municipalities who intend to use the LDSA process should participate in the selection of the Regional List.

The coordinator shall develop a summary and scoring sheet of the A/E Consultants responding with EOI's and distribute to the selection committee. The maximum number of consultants selected to the regional list may not exceed 15 per region. This number should be based upon the number of projects proposed for each county within their perspective NYSDOT Region.

The LDSA regional coordinator shall schedule a regional selection committee meeting at which time the number of consultants required for the region shall be established prior to beginning the selection of consultants. Scoring of the consultants for the regional list shall be based upon the criteria and scoring as established in the Request for Qualifications (RFQ). Rating sheets are working documents not subject to FOIL and should not be distributed to any individual party.

Once the Regional list is established, the LDSA regional coordinator sends the list of consultants to NYSCHSA. Notice of results will be announced by NYSCHSA once all regions have sent the final lists. Do not announce your regional list to anyone until NYSCHSA has published the statewide list.

Each municipality that participates in ranking of the regional list may also generate from the same regional rating its own short list (5 firms) of consultants as described subsequently in this document.

Each municipality involved with the selection of the regional consultant list shall use the rating criteria as specified in the Request for Qualifications (**Highway, Bridge, and**

Related Municipal Engineering Services Designations – Municipalities in NYSDOT Regions 1 through 9) document and is shown below.

**REGIONAL SCORE SHEET/RFQ
SELECTION CRITERIA FOR A/E CONSULTANTS**

CRITERIA	MAXIMUM POINTS	RATING
Experience and Qualification of Proposed Staff	30	
Experience of Firm or Team with Federal Aid Highway and Bridge Design Project	15	
Experience of Firm with Locally Administered Federal Aid Projects	10	
Experience of Firm or Team with Environmental Issues	10	
Community Participation	10	
Logistics and Familiarity with the Selection Area	20	
Percentage of Proposed DBE Participation	5	
TOTAL	100	

A.2 Use of the LDSA Regional Consultant List

Once the Regional list is established it may be used by any municipalities within the region. Using the list is not mandatory. The sponsoring entity may make its selection from the approved Regional list by conducting a separate evaluation by the municipality’s selection committee that must be comprised of not less than three (3) members. The selection may be made by a review of the material submitted for the original RFQ or additional information may be requested from all interested consultants on the regional list.

The municipalities may, if desired, conduct interviews of the firms as part of their selection process. To avoid the high production cost normally associated with the on-site interview process, NYSCHSA suggests that you meet only with the project manager and chief designer without having them prepare any formal presentation. This model promotes a relaxed conversation with those most involved in the project.

The selection criteria will be based upon the specific project requirements. The municipality rating protocol may vary from that specified in the regional selection procedure. A copy of the selection criteria and ratings must be placed in the project file and available for audit. Selection criteria may include but not be limited to, previous experience with municipality (not to be weighted more than 20%) experience with similar projects, experience of proposed staff, etc. For additional criteria please refer to Procedures for Locally Administered Federal Aid Projects, Volume 1 – Guidelines, Chapter 6.

Based on the general information provided above and to assure consistency, users of the LDSA regional list are required to adhere to the following procedures:

- The project sponsor selects a minimum 3-person selection committee that should include, when suitably available, one elected official or other non-staff individual holding interest in the project.
- The selection committee establishes the rating protocol prior to solicitation of the firm.
- All firms on the Regional list must be contacted to provide them an opportunity for consideration.

Regional List Selection Procedures

A.2.1 Project sponsors have two choices in identifying candidates from the Regional list

a. Review the EOI of each firm and make a selection(s) by ranking each firm

- or -

b. Project sponsor prepares a 1-2 page project description and requests a supplemental 1-3 page proposal from each firm that may address the following areas:

- The firm's ability to perform the work
- The firm's ability to meet the project schedule by analyzing the firm's workload
- The specific personnel that the firm will assign to the project. If the project sponsor believes the project requires specialized skills, the sponsor is to notify all firms and offer the consultant the opportunity to add to the team contained in the EOI.
- Provide the firm with the opportunity to supply additional information regarding their expertise and experience with similar projects or work

Review each firm's EOI and the supplemented submission.

A.2.2 Project sponsor rates and ranks firms under consideration based upon selection criteria identified for the project (see Chapter 6 of the manual entitled "Procedures for Locally Administered Federal Aid Projects", particularly Figure 6-4).

A.2.3 At the discretion of the project sponsor, conduct final oral interviews and/or interview with top-ranked consultant(s).

A.2.4 Final selection is made and documentation of selection is sent to the NYSDOT Regional Office Local Projects Unit. This is a Qualification Based Selection (QBS) process. Any discussion of fee shall be done after selection of the consultant. All firms submitting proposals will

receive notification from the project sponsor on the result of the selection process. All individual firms' rating/rankings are considered working documents and will not be disseminated for review by anyone other than NYSDOT.

A.2.5 Project sponsor begins task list preparation and negotiation of costs with selected consultant.

B. MUNICIPAL SHORT LIST OF FIRMS

B.1 Selections of the municipal short list of qualified firms

A municipality involved in the Regional list selection, may elect to establish a "short-list" of qualified A/E Consultants to perform federal aid engineering project within their individual municipality. The determination to establish this short-list should be based upon an evaluation of the number of proposed/potential federal aid projects during the next several years in the municipality.

If so desired a short-list of up to five A/E Consultants can be established. That list shall be established by a modified application of the original rating of the RFQ responses. The method of establishing that short-list of five (5) A/E Consultants shall be by applying a 50% weight to the original RFQ selection score of that municipality and distributing the remaining 50% weighted equally to each of the remaining original RFQ scores from the other municipalities participating in the original selection process.

The determination to establish a short-list of A/E Consultants should be performed concurrently with the original RFQ scoring or within several days after the concluding the original RFQ scoring.

Once a short list is established, the municipality must use it for subsequent project selections, unless there are compelling reasons for the municipalities to use the regional list. Such "compelling reasons" are limited as all firms have opportunity to change teams or add project specific expertise per the methods described herein and in the RFP. Examples of "compelling reasons" may be if most firms on the short list have heavy workloads that threaten schedules or business dissolution. However, the project sponsor can always chose to perform, on any project, an open selection using the full federal consultant selection procedure.

B.2 Use of the municipality LDSA short list of consultants

When the municipality establishes a short list, they shall use the following procedures in selecting a consultant:

All users of the LDSA short list firms must do the following:

- All firms on the municipality's short list must be contacted to see if they want to be considered for possible selection
- Selection off the short list can be done by an individual or a selection committee.

- Write a summary justifying your selection from the short list.

Individual Municipality Short List Selection Procedures.

- B.2.1 Project Sponsors have two choices in identifying candidates from the short-list:
- a. Review the EOI of each firm and make a selection(s) by ranking each firm. Rating and selection can be made directly from this list using the EOI without any other documentation.

- or -

- b. Project sponsor prepares a 1-2 page project description and requests a supplemental 1-3 page proposal that may address the following areas:
 - The firm's ability to perform the work
 - The firm's ability to meet the project schedule by analyzing the firm's workload
 - The specific personnel that the firm will assign to the project
 - Provide the firm with the opportunity to supply additional information regarding their expertise and experience with similar projects or work
 - If special expertise is required, the sponsoring agency is to notify all short-listed firms to provide them the opportunity to augment his/her team to address that special expertise.

Review each firm's EOI and the supplemented submission.

- B.2.2. At its discretion, the project sponsor conducts final oral interviews and/or in-person interview with consultant(s) under consideration.
- B.2.3. Project sponsor makes final selection and documents selection by completing a summary justifying the selection. This is a Qualification Based Selection (QBS) process. Any discussion of fee shall be done after the selection of the consultant. If the municipality decides to abandon use of the short list for a particular project, a full written justification shall be reviewed with the NYSDOT and placed in the project file.
- B.2.4 Send a final copy of the justification and determination to the NYS Regional Local Projects Unit. Project sponsor shall notify short-list firms on who was selected, but are not obligated to reveal any individuals firms rating and/or ranking.
- B.2.5. Project sponsor begins task list preparation and negotiation of costs with selected consultant.